On Optimal Control Problems which Admit an Infinite Continuous Group of Transformations

Delfim F. M. Torres

delfim@mat.ua.pt

Department of Mathematics
University of Aveiro
3810–193 Aveiro, Portugal

http://www.mat.ua.pt/delfim



Fundamental Problem of the Calculus of Variations

$$J[x(\cdot)] = \int_{a}^{b} L(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) dt \longrightarrow \min$$
$$(x(a), x(b)) \in \mathcal{F}$$
$$x(\cdot) \in W_{1,\infty}([a, b]; \mathbb{R}^{n})$$
$$C^{1} \ni L: [a, b] \times \mathbb{R}^{n} \times \mathbb{R}^{n} \to \mathbb{R}$$

 \star If $x(\cdot)$ is a minimizer of the FPCV, then $x(\cdot)$ is an Euler-Lagrange extremal (ELE):

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} (t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} (t, x(t), \dot{x}(t))$$

A quantity $C(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t))$ which is constant along every ELE, $C(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) = \text{constant}, \qquad (1)$

is called a First Integral or a Conserved Current (CC);

(1) is the corresponding Conservation Law.

Noether's First Theorem \iff Finite Symmetries

Let $G_{\rho}(T, X)$ be a ρ parameter group of transformations $t \to T(t, x, \varepsilon_s), x \to X(t, x, \varepsilon_s)$, where $\varepsilon_s, s = 1, \ldots, \rho$, denote the ρ independent parameters of the group.

Definition. The FPCV is invariant under $G_{\rho}(T, X)$ if, and only if,

$$L\left(T\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right),X\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right),\frac{\frac{\mathrm{d}X\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right)}{\mathrm{d}t}}{\frac{\mathrm{d}T\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right)}{\mathrm{d}t}}\right)\frac{\mathrm{d}T\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right)}{\mathrm{d}t}$$

$$=L\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right)$$

Noether's First Theorem. If the FPCV is invariant under a finite continuous group $G_{\rho}(T, X)$, then there result ρ CCs:

$$\left(L\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right) - \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}}\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right) \cdot \dot{x}(t)\right) \frac{\partial}{\partial \varepsilon_{s}} T\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right) \Big|_{0} + \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}}\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right) \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial \varepsilon_{s}} X\left(t,x(t),\varepsilon_{s}\right) \Big|_{0}$$

Let $G_{\rho^{\infty}}(T, X)$ be an infinite continuous group of transformations depending upon ρ arbitrary and independent functions $p_s(\cdot) \in C^m([a, b]; \mathbb{R})$ together with their derivatives $(s = 1, \ldots, \rho)$: $t \to T\left(t, x, p_s(t), \ldots, p_s^{(m)}(t)\right), x \to X\left(t, x, p_s(t), \ldots, p_s^{(m)}(t)\right)$

Definition. The FPCV is invariant under $G_{\rho^{\infty}}(T,X)$ iff

$$L\left(T\left(\alpha(t)\right), X\left(\alpha(t)\right), \frac{\frac{\mathrm{d}X(\alpha(t))}{\mathrm{d}t}}{\frac{\mathrm{d}T(\alpha(t))}{\mathrm{d}t}}\right) \frac{\mathrm{d}T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\mathrm{d}t} = L\left(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)\right)$$
where $\alpha(t) = \left(t, x(t), p_s(t), \dot{p}_s(t), \dots, p_s^{(m)}(t)\right)$

Noether's Second Theorem. If the FPCV is invariant under an infinite group $G_{\rho^{\infty}}(T,X)$, then there result $\rho(m+1)$ CCs:

$$\left(L\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right) - \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}}\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right) \cdot \dot{x}(t)\right) \frac{\partial}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} T\left(\alpha(t)\right) \Big|_{0} + \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}}\left(t,x(t),\dot{x}(t)\right) \cdot \frac{\partial}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} X\left(\alpha(t)\right) \Big|_{0}$$

The Source be with You

- → Noether's Second Theorem has been widely forgotten
- → Failure to appreciate that Emmy Noether offered not one but two theorems in her 1918 paper is source of widespread confusion (cf. K. Brading, Noether's Theorem and Gauge Symmetries)
- → The few mentions to Noether's Second Theorem usually assert, wrongly, that the result is a particular case of the First Theorem! (e.g. Giaquinta & Hildebrandt, Calculus of variations I)
- There is an insight in original Noether's fundamental paper which I claim to be important enough to be called the *Third* Noether Theorem: if one looks at G_{ρ} has a rigid subgroup of $G_{\rho^{\infty}}$, in the sense that G_{ρ} arises from $G_{\rho^{\infty}}$ by fixing $p_s(t) = \varepsilon_s = \text{const}$, then the First Theorem is a consequence of the Second.

The Facts of Life

- ★ The Calculus of Variations is part of Optimal Control
- ★ The concepts of symmetry, conserved current, and reduction are a very useful tool in Optimal Control (e.g. stability, regularity)
- ★ The optimal control literature on First Noether-Type theorems is now vast: e.g.
 - → D. S. Đukić, 1973
 - → A. van der Schaft, 1981, 1987
 - → H. Sussmann, 1995
 - → V. Jurdjevic, 1997
 - → G. Blankenstein & A. van der Schaft, 2001
 - → D. F. M. Torres, 2002

No Second Noether-type theorem is available for Optimal Control

The Optimal Control Problem (OCP)

$$J[x(\cdot), u(\cdot)] = \int_{a}^{b} L(t, x(t), u(t)) dt \longrightarrow \min$$

$$\dot{x}(t) = \varphi(t, x(t), u(t))$$

$$(x(a), x(b)) \in \mathcal{F}$$

$$x(\cdot) \in W_{1,1}([a,b]; \mathbb{R}^n), \quad u(\cdot) \in L_{\infty}([a,b]; \Omega \subseteq \mathbb{R}^r)$$

$$C^1 \ni L : [a, b] \times \mathbb{R}^n \times \Omega \to \mathbb{R}, \quad C^1 \ni \varphi : [a, b] \times \mathbb{R}^n \times \Omega \to \mathbb{R}^n$$

★ If $(x(\cdot), u(\cdot))$ is a minimizer, then $\exists (\psi_0, \psi(\cdot)) \neq 0, \psi_0 \leq 0,$ $\psi(\cdot) \in W_{1,1}^n$, s.t. $(x(\cdot), u(\cdot), \psi_0, \psi(\cdot))$ is a Pontryagin extremal:

$$\dot{\psi} = -\frac{\partial H}{\partial x}$$
, $H(t, x(t), u(t), \psi_0, \psi(t)) = \sup_{u \in \Omega} H(t, x(t), u, \psi_0, \psi(t))$

with the Hamiltonian $H(t, x, u, \psi_0, \psi) = \psi_0 L(t, x, u) + \psi \cdot \varphi(t, x, u)$.

Definition. A function $C(t, x, u, \psi_0, \psi)$ which is constant in t along every Pontryagin extremal, will be called a Noether current

The Semi-Invariance Definition Gauge Symmetry

Let $C^m \ni p : [a, b] \to \mathbb{R}^{\rho}$ be an arbitrary function, and let $\alpha(t)$ to denote $(t, x(t), u(t), p(t), \dot{p}(t), \dots, p^{(m)}(t))$. We say that the OCP is semi-invariant under the C^1 transformation group $G_{\rho^{\infty}}(T, X, U)$ iff

$$\star \left(\lambda^{0} \cdot p(t) + \lambda^{1} \cdot \dot{p}(t) + \dots + \lambda^{m} \cdot p^{(m)}(t)\right) \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} L\left(t, x(t), u(t)\right)$$

$$+ L\left(t, x(t), u(t)\right) + \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} F\left(\alpha(t)\right)$$

$$= L\left(T\left(\alpha(t)\right), X\left(\alpha(t)\right), U\left(\alpha(t)\right)\right) \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} T\left(\alpha(t)\right) ,$$

$$\star \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} X\left(\alpha(t)\right) = \varphi\left(T\left(\alpha(t)\right), X\left(\alpha(t)\right), U\left(\alpha(t)\right)\right) \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} T\left(\alpha(t)\right) ,$$

for some function F of class C^1 and for some $\lambda^0, \ldots, \lambda^m \in \mathbb{R}^{\rho}$.

We are assuming that to $p(t) = \dot{p}(t) = \cdots = p^{(m)}(t) = 0$ there corresponds the identity transformation: $T(t, x, u, 0, 0, \dots, 0) = t$, $X(t, x, u, 0, 0, \dots, 0) = x$, $U(t, x, u, 0, 0, \dots, 0) = u$

Generalized Noether-type Identities

Theorem. Suppose that the OCP is semi-invariant under the infinite group $G_{\rho^{\infty}}(T, X, U)$. Then, the following conditions hold:

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left(\lambda_{s}^{i} L + \frac{\partial F\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \right) = \frac{\partial L}{\partial t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial X\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial L}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + L \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial X\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} = \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial x} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial X\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial u} \right|_{0} \\
+ \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial u} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac{\partial U\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial u} \right|_{0} + \varphi \frac$$

- ✓ The proof follows from the previous definition of semi-invariance
- → The conditions hold for all functions $x(\cdot) \in W_{1,1}^n$ and $u(\cdot) \in L_{\infty}^r$, whether they are Pontryagin extremals or not

Second Noether Theorem for Optimal Control

Theorem. If the OCP is semi-invariant under $G_{\rho^{\infty}}(T,X,U)$, then there exist $\rho(m+1)$ Noether currents of the form

$$\psi_{0}\left(\lambda_{s}^{i}L\left(t,x(t),u(t)\right)+\left.\frac{\partial F\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}}\right|_{0}\right)+\psi(t)\cdot\left.\frac{\partial X\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}}\right|_{0}$$

$$-H(t,x(t),u(t),\psi_{0},\psi(t))\left.\frac{\partial T\left(\alpha(t)\right)}{\partial p_{s}^{(i)}}\right|_{0}$$
Example

$$L \equiv 1, \, \varphi = u$$

$$T \longrightarrow \min$$

$$\dot{x}(t) = u(t)$$

$$u(t) \in (-1, 1)$$

$$x(0) = \alpha, x(T) = \beta$$

$$G_{1^{\infty}}\left(T,X,U
ight)$$

Noether Currents

$$T \longrightarrow \min$$
 $\dot{x}(t) = u(t)$
 $u(t) \in (-1, 1)$
 $0 = \alpha, x(T) = \beta$

$$\begin{cases}
T = p(t) + t, & \psi_0 - H \\
X = (\dot{p}(t) + 1)^2 x(t), & 2\psi(t)x(t) \\
U = (\dot{p}(t) + 1)u(t) + 2\ddot{p}(t)x(t), \\
F = p(t), \quad \lambda_1^i = 0 \ (i = 0, 1, 2)
\end{cases}$$

Proof of the Second Noether-type Theorem

 \bigstar Let $(x(\cdot), u(\cdot), \psi_0, \psi(\cdot))$ be any extremal. Maximality Condition \Rightarrow

$$\left. \psi_0 \frac{\partial L}{\partial u} \cdot \frac{\partial U(\alpha(t))}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 + \psi(t) \cdot \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial u} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial U(\alpha(t))}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 = 0 \tag{2}$$

 \star (2) + Generalized Noether Identities \Rightarrow

$$\psi_0 \left(\frac{\partial L}{\partial t} \left. \frac{\partial T}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 + \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \cdot \left. \frac{\partial X}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 + L \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial T}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 - \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left. \frac{\partial F}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 - \lambda_s^i \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} L \right)$$

$$+\psi(t)\cdot\left(\frac{\partial\varphi}{\partial t}\left.\frac{\partial T}{\partial p_s^{(i)}}\right|_0 + \frac{\partial\varphi}{\partial x}\cdot\left.\frac{\partial X}{\partial p_s^{(i)}}\right|_0 + \varphi\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t}\left.\frac{\partial T}{\partial p_s^{(i)}}\right|_0 - \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t}\left.\frac{\partial X}{\partial p_s^{(i)}}\right|_0\right) = 0$$
(3)

 \bigstar (3) + Adjoint system + property $\frac{dH}{dt} = \frac{\partial H}{\partial t}$ of the extremals \Rightarrow

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \left(\psi_0 \left. \frac{\partial F}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 + \psi_0 \lambda_s^i L + \psi(t) \cdot \left. \frac{\partial X}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 - H \left. \frac{\partial T}{\partial p_s^{(i)}} \right|_0 \right) = 0$$

Conclusions

The genuine Emmy Noether's theorem is the second, not the first!

- ✓ In this paper we provide an extension of second Noether's theorem from the calculus of variations to the more general optimal control framework.
- ✓ As corollaries one can obtain, using Noether's remark, the previous optimal control versions of the first Noether theorem.

Our Main Result admits several extensions. E.g.

- → More general Symmetries can be considered (cf. the quasi-invariance notion introduced by Torres in Proc. 10th Mediterranean Conference on Control and Automation, MED2002)
- → A broad class of optimal control problems involving holonomic or nonholonomic constraints can be considered. A version for problems with mixed constrains is under development.